Literally Big Nano: Nano-Engineered Composites for Aerospace and Infrastructure Applications



nano-engineered composite aerospace structures consortium

University of Tokyo, GMSI GCoE Seminar Tokyo, Japan December 15, 2009

Prof. Brian L. Wardle<sup>†</sup>, et al.

<sup>†</sup>Director, Nano-Engineered Composite aerospace STructures (NECST) Consortium Technology Laboratory for Advanced Materials and Structures (TELAMS) Department of Aeronautics and Astronautics Massachusetts Institute of Technology







### Overview: "Of Nanotubes and Airplanes"

- Opportunities and challenges in advanced composites, and the role of nanotechnology
- Polymer composites and nanocomposites using aligned carbon nanotubes
  - Nano-engineered (fiber-based) advanced composites for aerospace applications
  - Controlled-morphology polymer nanocomposites
- Supporting work and extensions



meters







# Existing (Laminated) Advanced Composites



Advanced Composites and Carbon Nanotubes (CNTs)



Chart after M.F. Ashby

B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-4

### Nano-Engineered (Hybrid) Composites

Use aligned CNTs to reinforce and tailor existing advanced composites





Garcia, Wardle, et al., Comp. Sci. Tech. and Composites A., 2008.

## Composite Opportunities for 3D Nanoscale Enhancement and Tailoring

- Fix weak interfaces in composites
  - Delamination (cracking between plies)
  - Toughness at interface ~100-1000X less than in-plane direction
- Conductivity enhancement: electrostatic discharge, EMI shielding, lightning-strike protection, thermal enhancement
- Other key properties such as laminate bearing strength, etc.



# Nanocomposites, Yarns, and **Nano-Engineered Composites**

Nanocomposites: Modify matrix (typically polymer) by addition of nanoparticles, including CNTs



### Nano-engineered Composites

- Hybrid composites using aligned CNTs to reinforce and tailor existing composites
- E.g., "stitch" across ply interlaminar regions

<u>CNT Yarns, Sheets, Hybrid Fibers:</u> Replace (carbon) fiber with discontinuous-CNT forms



Layered

(plies)

ply interfaces





B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-7

### Scale Challenge for Hybrid Composites





# A Very Little (Femto?) on Carbon Nanotubes (CNTs)

- Rolled graphene sheet (lijima 1991, Endo), "Buckytubes"
- CNTs are not the same and differences are IMPORTANT
  - Single vs. multi-walled
  - Size (diameter and especially length)
  - Purity, or converse, defects
  - Chirality (rolling angle)...
- CNTs are "grown" from catalyst "seeds", sometimes into "forests" using a variety of processes: differences are IMPORTANT
- Intense research worldwide, esp. microelectronics applications (CNTs can be ballistic conductors)



~1-10 nm

Images: Hart & Garcia

### Growth of Aligned CNTs for Composites



- Atmospheric pressure chemical vapor deposition process
- Self-aligned morphology, 10<sup>10</sup>-10<sup>11</sup>/cm<sup>2</sup>
- Long forests (up to 5 mm) of <u>continuous</u> CNTs
- 7-10 nm outer diameter, 2-3 walls
- Rapid growth; > 2 microns/second





### The Wardle Group CNT Farm



EHS Note: Bello, Wardle, et al., *J. Nanoparticle Research,* Jan. 2009; Bello et al., *Carbon*, 2008. Bello, Wardle et al., ICCM 2009.

# Processing Nano-engineered Composites Enabled Via Capillarity-induced Wetting of *Aligned* CNTs



- Identification of wetting route
  - Highly preferred along CNT axis
  - Secondary wetting perpendicular to CNTs

Wardle et al, *Adv. Mat.,* 2008. Garcia, Wardle et al., *Nanotechnology* 2007.



Garcia, Wardle et al., *Comp. Sci. & Tech.*, 2008.

## Example of Epoxy Wetting CNTs: Flow-front Visualization



- Volume Fraction of CNT = 1%
- Length of CNT = 0.65 mm
- CNT-CNT spacing = 80 nm
- Wetting time = 13 seconds
- Infiltration Rate = 0.05 mm/s

Cebeci, (Wardle), et al., *SAMPE Fall Conf.*, 2008.

B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-13

# Video of Epoxy (RTM6) Wetting an Aligned CNT Forest



Cebeci, (Wardle), et al., *SAMPE Fall Conf.*, 2008.

Long-range Nanostructured Order Via Combined Topdown and Bottom-up Processing



Garcia, Wardle et al., Comp. Sci. & Tech., 2008.

# Wardle Group Nano-Engineered Composites Research



#### (4) Processing/fabrication

areas:

- (1) Nano-engineered composite mechanics of plies, laminates and substructures
- (2) Structural design (bonded and bolted joints, impact resistance and tolerance, etc.)
  - (3) *Materials engineering* of nanocomposites (interface topics: CNT-CNT, CNT-polymer, CNT-fiber)
  - (4) <u>Processing/fab</u> (CNT alignment, dispersion, integration with existing composite manufacturing) B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-16

## **Recent Contributions**



Something different

6.

## **Recent Contributions**



Something different

6.

### **Toughening Mechanism of CNT/Fiber Bridging**

Mode I R-curve for a non-bridged laminate



• Mode I R-curve for a **bridged laminate**  $G_R$ 



### Steady-state Solution for Mode I Toughening

 Using the expression for the closing traction in the J-integral result for toughening:

$$G_R(\Delta a) = G_0 + 2 \int_0^{\widetilde{u}(\Delta a)} p(x) du \qquad p(x) = \frac{v_{CNT} \tau_c L_{CNT}}{r} - \frac{2v_{CNT} \tau_c}{r} u(x)$$

Yields:

$$\frac{G_{ss}}{G_0} = 1 + \frac{1}{2} \left( \underbrace{\frac{L_{CNT}}{r}}_{F} \right) \underbrace{\frac{v_{CNT} \tau_c L_{CNT}}{G_0}}_{G_0}$$

•  $G_{ss}/G_0$  is a function of the **fiber aspect ratio** and **pullout energy** 

# Effect of Scale of Reinforcement: CNTs vs. 'Z-pins'



Blanco, Wardle et al., J. Composite Materials, April 2009.

B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-21

## **Recent Contributions**





Something different

6.

### 1<sup>st</sup> Architecture: 'Nanostitches' = Aligned CNTs at Ply Interfaces





# Nanostitching: Aligned CNT Transfer to Aerospace Graphite/Epoxy Composite Prepreg



- 1. Grow aligned CNTs on hightemp. substrate
- 2. Transplant CNTs to composite at low-temp.
- 3. Process the composite





Garcia, Wardle, et al., *Composites A*., 2008.

### Video of Nanostitch Transfer to Prepreg





### Summary Fracture Data on Two Prepreg Systems Reinforced with Aligned CNTs



Garcia, Wardle, et al., *Composites Part A*, 2008.

# Observation of Mode I CNT Pullout Consistent with Bridging Modeling





B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-27

### 2<sup>nd</sup> Architecture: Fuzzy Fiber Reinforced Plastics (FFRPs) = Aligned CNTs Everywhere



Garcia, (Wardle), et al., *AIAA J.,* 2008 (AIAA SDM 2006). *Composites Science & Technology*, 2008.

# Aligned CNT Growth on Alumina Cloth for Composites



Garcia, Hart, Wardle, *AIAA J.,* 2008 (AIAA SDM 2006). Yamamoto et al., *Carbon*, 2009.

### Intralaminar Reinforcement - Growth of CNTs on Alumina Fiber Cloth and Hose

### **Before Growth**

**After Growth** 



≈125 mm



Garcia et al., AIAA SDM, April 2006, Yamamoto et al., ICCM-16, July 2007, Yamamoto et al., *Carbon*, 2009.

### 'Fuzzy Fiber' Composites Realized

• No voids observed @ 10 micron resolution



Garcia, Wardle, et al., *Comp. Sci. & Tech.,* 2008.

# Summary Laminate-level Data for 'Fuzzy Fiber' Composites



Garcia, Wardle, et al., *Comp. Sci. & Tech.*, 2008. Yamamoto & Wardle, *AIAA SDM Conf.*, 2008. (Best student paper)

## Larger-scale Manufacturing Allows Mode I DCB Testing of Fuzzy-Fiber Composites



Wicks, (Wardle), et al., *Comp. Sci. & Tech.,* 2010.

# CNTs Toughen a Tough (Woven) System

- Mode I DCB fracture tests show significant toughening
  - Initiation and steadystate
  - Crack bridging by aligned CNTs noted in fracture surfaces





Wicks, (Wardle), et al., Comp. Sci. & Tech., 2010.

### Model-Experiment Correlation: Representative R-curves





Experimental values used to populate Mode I toughness model:

- SEM indicates pulled-out CNTs ~1-3 μm long
- 0.6% V<sub>f</sub>, 14 nm diameter
  CNTs from synthesis/growth



Wicks, (Wardle), et al., Comp. Sci. & Tech., 2010.

# In-plane Strength Assessed via Tension-Bearing Testing

Fuzzy Fibers Contribute 3D-Reinforcement at Hole



- Assess in-plane strength effects to complement interlaminar fracture
  - 3 samples each
  - ~2% V<sub>f</sub> CNTs
  - Post-test characterization via optical and SEM


#### Small Increase in all Values; Clear Failure Mode Change



B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-37

# **Nano-Engineered Composites** Aligned **CNTs Epoxy Matrix** ά*Π* Fiber cross section Woven fiber cloth





#### Aligned-CNTs Grown on Cloth for FFRP



Pliī

#### Can FFRP be Infusion-Processed?



#### Cryogenic Fracture Surfaces: Microscopy Reveals CNTs Remain on Fibers



Ishiguro, (Wardle), et al., ASC Conference, 2009.

### Infusion Yields Improved Void/Volume Fractions

#### 1 mm











- Voids are assessed on polished cross sections using optical microscopy
- No meaningful voids, and improvement noted for fuzzy-fiber ply (vs. hand layup)
  - Baseline alumina 0.00 % voids, (hand layup: 0.34%)
  - FFRP 0.09% voids, (hand layup: 1.36%)
- Improved fiber volume fraction between FFRP and Baseline samples
  - 7% difference(hand layup: 12% difference)
  - Near-term goal is additional process refinements to achieve 0% difference

MicroCT analysis being developed for non-destructive void and volume fraction assessment

Ishiguro, (Wardle), et al., ASC Conference, 2009.

#### Infusion Process Refinements: Thickness Control and Uniformity

**3-Laminate Fabrication** 





#### Non-mechanical FFRP Attributes Such as Electrical Conductivity Can Enable New Functionality



Garcia, Wardle, et al., *Comp. Sci. & Tech.*, 2008.
 Yamamoto & Wardle, *AIAA SDM Conf.*, 2008. (Best student paper)

#### CNT-enabled Non-desctructive Evaluation and Health Monitoring

- SHM improves reliability, safety & readiness at reduced costs
  - Sensors add weight, power consumption & computational bandwidth
  - Cables add weight, complexity, as well as durability & EMI concerns
  - Scaling SHM for large-area coverage has presented challenges
- Proposed CNT-based sensing methodology
  - Sensing elements actually *improve* specific strength/stiffness of structure
  - Conformal direct-write (DW) electrodes lighter & more durable than cable
  - Simple to scale over large structure, maintains good local resolution







#### **CNT-enabled NDE and SHM**

- Aligned CNTs greatly enhance composite laminate properties
  - Mechanically improves toughness and strength
  - Multifunctional capabilities introduced by electrical conductivity & piezoresistivity
- Present research exploits CNTs for *in-situ* damage imaging
  - Direct-write (DW) electrode grids applied similar to LCD technology
  - In-plane & through-thickness resistance measurements collected
  - Surface & sub-surface damage images produced in post-processing





Barber, (Wardle), et al., SAMPE Fall Technical Conference, 2009.

#### **Proof-of-concept Results**

- Baseline specimens (no CNTs) have > 5 M $\Omega$  resistance before and after impact, illustrating that there is no suitable conductive path without CNTs
- In-plane resistance between parallel pairs of adjacent traces
  - > 100% change in middle traces,
     < 10% change for outermost trace pairs</li>
  - Appears to be more sensitive to surface cracking
- Through-thickness resistance at each virtual grid point
  - 56 through-thickness grid points averaged 20  $\Omega$  resistance pre-impact
  - > 100% change in middle points,
     < 10% change for "left" half</li>
  - Resistance offset introduced by cracks across traces on "right" half
  - Appears to be more sensitive to delamination



Back, In-Plane Resistance Change less than 1% (not plotted)





Barber, (Wardle), et al., SAMPE Fall Technical Conference, 2009.

B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-47

#### **Recent Contributions**





Something different

6.

#### RVE for Nano-engineered Composites is an Aligned-CNT Polymer Nanocomposite (PNC)



Illustrations not to scale

Wardle et al., Adv. Materials 2008; Nanotechnology 2007; etc.

B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-49

#### Fundamental Property and Transport Studies Using Ideal-Morphology Nanocomposites



 Polymer structure-pro changes when CNTs ~10 nm apart?

*E.g.,* CNT spacing is I than polymer characteristic chain lengths...

MD simulation of polyimide & CNTs [Courtesy G. Odegard, MTU]

### Platform for Making (near theoretical) High Volume Fraction Nanocomposites

Before mechanical densification



After densification









#### "EZ" Delamination of Aligned-CNT Forests





#### **Biaxial CNT Forest Densification Video**



Wardle et al., *Advanced Materials*, 2008.

### Variable Volume Fraction Aligned-CNT Polymer Nanocomposites with Controlled Morphology



Cebeci, Wardle, et al., Comp. Sci. Tech., 2009.

- Vol. fraction varies (CNTs aligned, also random): 1%, 8%, 20% V<sub>f</sub>
- Modulus and electrical conductivity characterized



Axial Direction



Transverse Direction

 Unmodified RTM6 aerospace-grade epoxy (resin-transfer molding, RTM)

#### Aligned-CNT Morphology in Polymer Nanocomposites





#### Aligned-CNT PNC Modulus vs. Literature



#### Understanding Modulus Using Simple Rule of Mixtures Modified for CNT Waviness





Fisher et al., APL, 2002.

SEM inspection of aligned-CNTs for amplitude-wavelength ratio

Fisher, F. T., Bradshaw, R. D. & Brinson, L. C. Effects of nanotube waviness on the modulus of nanotube-reinforced polymers. *Appl Phys Lett* **80**, 4647-4649 (2002).



Cebeci, Wardle, et al., Comp. Sci. Tech., 2009.

#### CNT Waviness Seen as Dominant Feature Affecting PNC Modulus



#### Direction-dependent Electrical Conductivity Also Shows Effect of Controlled Morphology



<sup>Bauhofer, W., Kovacs, J. Z. A review and analysis of electrical percolation in carbon nanotube polymer composites</sup> *Compos Sci Technol* in press (2009).
Cebeci, Wardle, et al., *Comp. Sci. Tech.*, 2009.

B. L. Wa

#### Modeling Thermal Conductivity of CNT Nanocomposites Using Random Walk Algorithm (Offlattice Monte-Carlo Simulation)

#### CNT morphology in polymer matrix:

Randomly generated in a computational cell (polymeric matrix) with different orientations: (parallel, random and perpendicular to heat flux).

With and without inter-CNT contact. Assumes line CNT contact.

Spatial CNT agglomeration in matrix.

🗙 CNT waviness.

#### Thermal boundary resistances:

CNT-matrix and CNT-CNT TBRs.





#### Morphology Effects on Thermal Conductivity of CNT Nanocomposites



#### Effect of CNT Volume Fraction

- Increasing R<sub>bd</sub>: K<sub>eff</sub> decreases but not smaller than that of pure matrix
- Increasing CNT volume fraction: K<sub>eff</sub> increases



#### Effect of Heat Conduction Direction

- Increasing R<sub>bd-m-cn</sub>: K<sub>eff</sub> decreases, and even smaller than that of pure matrix with large CNT volume fraction
- Stronger effects by R<sub>bd-m-cn</sub> because phonons need to cross more boundaries



#### Effects of Inter-CNT Contact



### Thermal Conductivity Measurements (On-going)

- Picosecond thermoreflectance technique
  - Samples deposited with thin metal heat absorption/laser reflection film (Al 80nm)
  - Heating with laser pulse
  - Surface laser reflectance change measurement (a function of temperature)
- Thermal gradient measurement using a infrared detector
  - Resistive heating (known heat flux) on one side
  - Thermal boundary resistance isolation
  - No interpretation issues
  - Takes advantage of large aligned-CNT and aligned-CNT PNC sample sizes





[with Panzer, Marconnet, Goodson at Stanford]



#### **Recent Contributions**



B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-66

Something different

5.

#### Looking for Carbon Fiber-Friendly CNT Catalysts



Steiner III, (Wardle) et al., *JACS*, online Aug. 2009.

4ij

## Zirconia (ZrO<sub>2</sub>): A Non-Metallic CNT Catalyst

- ZrO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles catalyze CNT growth
- Catalyzes MWNTs and SWNTs
- Significant departure from understanding of other catalysts





#### More Evidence of CNTs from Zirconia



XRD Says There's Zirconia Nanoparticles but no Zr or ZrC!



# "The Refrigerator Light Problem" Solved: Catalyst is an Oxide *During* CNT Growth



In Situ X-Ray Photoelectron Spectroscopy of Catalyst on Surface in collaboration with Prof. Stephan Hofmann, Univ. of Cambridge

Steiner III, (Wardle) et al., *JACS*, online Aug. 2009.

B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-70

#### Implication-Rich Discovery for CNT Synthesis

saturday, august 15, 2009



massachusetts institute of technology

about mit facts | visit | map | global MIT

news research news | by topic | for media

education schools+departments | OpenCourseWare

admissions+financial aid undergrad | grad | professional

research labs+centers | libraries | cancer | energy

offices services | jobs | giving | Commencement

community students | staff | faculty | parents | alumni

calendars events | academic | arts | athletics

video courses, lectures, videos by+about MIT

#### ● MIT Google ● People ● Offices

Go

massachusetts institute of technology

77 massachusetts avenue cambridge, ma 02139-4307 tel 617.253.1000 tty 617.258.9344

today's spotlight:

bling bling

zirconia creates new possibilities

for carbon nanotube materials

about this site

contact



#### RECENT NEWS

MIT Alert test set for Aug. 18

Researchers identify drug compound that kills cancer stem cells

A new way to prepare fluorinated pharmaceuticals

Taking space in stride

more headlines...

#### EVENTS

Jun Nguyen-Hatsushiba's *Memorial Project Nha Trang, Vietnam* (Through September 7)

India's Independence Day Celebration (Tonight)

Swapfest (Tomorrow)

more events ...

Steiner III, (Wardle) et al., JACS, online Aug. 2009.

#### **Recent Contributions**





Something different

6.

### Continuous Manufacturing of Aligned CNTs Requires Moving Growth





Infusion (VARTM, RFI, etc.)





#### Moving Growth of Aligned CNTs



#### High-Yield Growth at All Substrate Velocities





Guzman deVilloria, (Wardle), et al., Nanotechnology, 2009.

#### **Recent Contributions**



6. Something different



#### **NECST Research Team**





**Derreck Barber** Undergrad MIT Aero/Astro



MIT Aero/Astro



Hulya Cebeci Visiting SM Student Visiting PhD Student MIT Aero/Astro



Hai Duong Postdoc MIT Aero/Astro



**Stacy Figueredo** PhD Candidate MIT Mech. Eng



Sean Pont Visiting SM Student MIT Aero/Astro



Fabio Fachin PhD Student MIT Aero/Astro



Roberto Guzman deVilloria Postdoc **MIT Aero/Astro** 



Kyoko Ishiguro Visiting PhD Student **MIT Aero/Astro** 



WooSik Kim Postdoc **MIT Aero/Astro** 



Undergrad **MIT Aero/Astro** 



**Alex Slocum** Prof. MIT ME



**Stephen Steiner III** Grad. Student MIT Aero/Astro



Megan Tsai Undergrad MIT Aero/Astro



Sreeram Vaddiraju Postdoc MIT Chem. Eng



**Brian Wardle** Prof. MIT Aero/Astro



**Sunny Wicks** SM Candidate MIT Aero/Astro



Namiko Yamamoto PhD Candidate MIT Aero/Astro B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-80



#### Acknowledgments

- MIT's Nano-engineered Composite STructures (NECST) Consortium:
  - Airbus S.A.S.
  - Boeing
  - Embraer
  - Lockheed Martin
  - Saab AB
  - Spirit AeroSystems
  - Textron Inc.
  - Composite Systems Technology
  - TohoTenax
- National Science Foundation (NSF)
- Air Force Office of Scientific Research (AFOSR)



- Materials donation: Hexcel Corp., Saab AB, and TohoTenax
- Collaborators: Prof. Gang Chen (MIT ME), Prof. Karen Gleason (MIT ChemE), Prof. Alex Slocum (MIT ME), Prof. Carl Thompson (MIT DMSE), Prof. Dhimiter Bello (UMass-Lowell) Prof. A. John Hart (Univ. of Michigan), Prof. Shigeo Maruyama (Univ. of Tokyo), Prof. Dimitrios Papavassiliou (Univ. of Oklahoma), Prof. James Seferis (Univ. of Washington, retired), Prof. Kenneth Goodson (Stanford Univ.), Prof. Stephan Hofmann (Cambridge Univ.), and many others...



nano-engineered composite aerospace structures consortium

#### Some aesthetics...





B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-82

...and some fun.



More at nanobliss.com

Images: A.J. Hart and E.J. Garcia

B. L. Wardle, wardle@mit.edu, Dec '09-83

#### "something funny happened to the catalyst here (at MI)..."

More at nanobama.com

Images: A.J. Hart

#### wardle@mit.edu

Thank you.



nano-engineered composite aerospace structures consortium

ASTRO



